



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



**ALFRED E. ALQUIST
SEISMIC SAFETY COMMISSION MEETING**

In-Person and Zoom Meeting
September 15, 2022

I. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Chairwoman Silva, at 10:30 a.m.
Tanya Black, Administrative Processes Manager, conducted the roll call.

Present:

Cindy Silva, Chair
Fuad Sweiss, Vice Chair
Ida Clair
Representative Diane Gould for Ida Clair
Representative Nestor Lopez for Ken Cooley
Alegria De La Cruz
Debra Garnes (Arrived at 10:54am)
Representative Lori Nezhura for Mark Ghilarducci
Joone Kim-Lopez
Mia Marvelli
Kevin McGowan
Representative Astghik Hakobyan for Anthony Portantino
David Rabbitt (Departed at 11:15am)

Absent:

Ken Cooley
Dr. H. Kit Miyamoto
Vincent Wells



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



II. Approval of Seismic Safety Commission July 7th, 2022, Meeting Minutes Discussion:

The Seismic Safety Commission (SSC) discussed the meeting minutes of July 7, 2022. Motion to approve by Commissioner De La Cruz, seconded by Commissioner Rabbitt. Motion passed.

Commissioner Clair abstained.

III. Chairman's Remarks

Chairwoman Silva began by mentioning the recent earthquake near Santa Rosa at a magnitude 4.4 that occurred on September 13, 2022. Chairwoman Silva stated that Representative Nezhura is the Deputy Director of the Planning, Preparedness, and Prevention Division of Cal OES.

IV. AB 100 Project – California Earthquake Authority “Helping to Mitigate California’s Seismic Risk”

Speaker – Janiele Maffei, S.E., Chief Mitigation Officer, California Earthquake Authority

Salina Valencia, Acting Executive Director introduced Janiele Maffei, Chief Mitigation Officer for the California Earthquake Authority (CEA) Ms. Maffei stated that she is presenting to the SSC as part of the statute requirements of AB 100. This legislation required SSC to work with specific state departments and various public entities to submit an annual report to the Governor and the Legislature on findings, progress, and recommendations towards higher levels of seismic safety and issues.

Ms. Maffei mentioned that the CEA is a not-for profit provider of residential earthquake insurance that is publicly managed but privately financed. The governing board consists of Governor Gavin Newsom, Insurance Commissioner Ricardo Lara, and State Treasurer Fiona Ma. The non-voting members are Assembly Speaker Anthony Rendon and Senate Rules Chair Toni Atkins. The mission of the CEA is to educate, mitigate, and insure its 1,137,713 policyholders.

CEA has various mitigation programs like Code Development, Earthquake Brace + Bolt (EBB), Earthquake Soft-Story (ESS), Multi-Family Soft-Story (MFSS), Hazard Reduction Discount (HRD) and Earthquake Response and Claim Handling (EDA). The Code Development program is co-directed by the CEA and Federal



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Emergency Management Agency (FEMA). It was published in 2018. The project is currently going through the American National Standards Institute (ANSI)-approved consensus process for development into a model code – ICC 1300. ICC-1300 is a standard intended to provide a methodology for identification, evaluation and retrofit of specific known vulnerabilities for one- and two-family wood light-frame residential buildings up to two stories in height located in Seismic Design Categories B through E. The top four seismic vulnerabilities in wood-framed single-family dwellings consist of crawlspace wall, living-space-over garage, hillside house and chimney of dwellings as shown above.

The Earthquake Brace + Bolt (EBB) program is established and managed by the California Residential Mitigation Program (CRMP). CRMP is a joint powers authority created by CEA and the Governor's Office of Emergency Services (Cal OES). The EBB pilot program opened in 2013 to carry out mitigation programs to assist California homeowners who wish to seismically retrofit their houses. The goal is to provide grants and other types of assistance and incentives. The program currently provides up to \$3,000 for a code-compliant retrofit of crawlspace.

Funding for this retrofit program comes from two different sources, the CRMP or FEMA. The program was awarded \$80 million from FEMA HMGP to CRMP for an additional 21,000 retrofits.

Ms. Maffei noted that the registration will be open for the EEB program and was going live on October 18, 2022, and there will be 15,000 available grants which will include supplemental grants to 521 program ZIP Codes. Registration for the EEB program can be accessed through their Earthquake Brace + Bolt program website. She stated the next program is the ESS which is managed by the California Residential Mitigation Program (CRMP) that will provide a grant for a code-compliant retrofit of wood-frame, single-family dwellings with living-space-over garages. The registration for this program will start in early 2023.

Ms. Maffei stated that the MFSS program will have potential funding in 2023 that will consist of a FEMA BRIC Grant for \$20 million and an allocation from SB 189 of \$250 million. The program looks to add steel frames to multi-family soft-story structures with "Tuck-Under Parking".



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



In addition to these programs, CEA offers a hazard reduction discount on certain older homes, if that home has been properly retrofitted.

The CEA also has available earthquake response and claim handling that was started after the 1994 Northridge earthquake. The Earthquake Damage Assessment and Repair Guidelines (EDA) was published and created by the Consortium of Universities for Research in Earthquake Engineering (CUREE). These guidelines have been updated, completed, and published in 2020. The guidelines are available for claim adjusters, contractors, Structural engineers/Architects, and geotechnical engineers.

Ms. Maffei thanked the SSC for the time to present and asked if there were any questions.

Discussion:

Chairwoman Silva thanked Mrs. Maffei for her presentation and asked if the programs are for all residents in California or if they are only for some geographic areas.

Ms. Maffei stated the programs began in four ZIP Codes to prevent a waiting list due to funding. Money is placed in areas with the highest risk and vulnerability. CEA has grown every year and now covers over 500 ZIP Codes. She also stated that Alameda and San Francisco are currently in the pilot program for the Multi-Family Soft-Story.

V. Update on the Recovery Status of the City of Ridgecrest Earthquake Sequence of July 2019

Speaker – Eric A. Bruen, Mayor, City of Ridgecrest

Ms. Valencia stated that the Ridgecrest earthquake sequence struck Ridgecrest and Trona on July 4th and July 5th in 2019. The earthquake with a magnitude of 6.4 struck on the 4th, and a 7.1 on July 5th. The great majority of nearly \$4 billion losses occurred at China Lake Naval Air Weapons Station, the region's largest employer.

On July 8th, 2019, the SSC deployed a team to view the damage in Ridgecrest and Trona who participated in the California Earthquake Clearinghouse.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



On September 11, 2019, the SSC held a hearing in Ridgecrest City Hall. During the hearing, Commissioners asked presenters questions that focused on their experience during the earthquake and what lessons learned could be passed on to local governments who will ultimately face damaging earthquakes in the future. The SSC appointed then Chair Michael Gardner, Vice Chair Mia Marvelli, and Commissioner Jim Hackett as an ad hoc committee to refine lessons learned and the report *The Ridgecrest Earthquake Sequence of 2019: Lessons Learned* was produced.

The SSC's emergency response plan called for efforts to review and assess adequacy of federal, state, and local laws, regulations, policies, and practices after an earthquake and to generate policy recommendations. The SSC produced similar reports in the aftermath of past damaging earthquakes, including the 2014 South Napa Earthquake, the 2010 El Mayor-Cuicapah Earthquake, and the 2003 San Simeon earthquake.

Ms. Valencia introduced Eric Bruen, Mayor of Ridgecrest, to give an update on the progress of the city of Ridgecrest and Trona.

Mr. Bruen thanked the SSC and stated that it is his second year as mayor and was not the mayor at the time of the 2019 earthquake.

Mr. Bruen stated that the Ridgecrest earthquake swarm had more than 34+ earthquakes within the 30-day time span, there was only one loss of life. There were two major quakes and a significant number of aftershocks and post shocks.

The long-term effects on Ridgecrest and its citizens include a heatwave that recently occurred.

Mr. Bruen commended the SSC for continuing to work on ShakeAlert and stated how these earthquakes had a psychological effect on the community.

Mr. Bruen also stated facilities that were well past their age of usefulness and were built long before California developed codes to help protect citizenship through earthquakes were summarily destroyed which ignited the need for modernization and for making properties code worthy.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Mr. Bruen stated that Ridgecrest today is on an incredible upswing due to the amount of damage that China Lake Naval Station received. Primarily due to that facility being built in the mid-40s and having a certain lack of upgrade during the 60s, 70s, 80s, and 90s, we have seen a surge in construction and opportunity within our community.

Mr. Bruen stated that since this earthquake sequence happened nine months before COVID-19, 80% of the local workforce had already shifted into a remote work environment because of the damage to the base.

Ridgecrest has continued to be able to monitor and advise. Mr. Bruen stated he believes the PTSD aspects of the community have slowly started to wear off. The fact that these earthquakes hit in a remote area, the biggest concern in the months following was what happens if this happens in the major metropolitan. Mr. Bruen stated that the number one concern of local councils, agencies, and response teams was if this earthquake had occurred within a 100-mile radius in a different direction, it is believed there would have been an equal impact based on size in terms of our property damage, potentially. Mobile home damage and a lot of brick damage was present that cannot be sustained if there are no code changes.

Mr. Bruen stated that they don't think they would have had the same level of response or support because of an urban area hit and that's something that a lot of businesses start to take into effect. This includes creating more alternative energy consumption, solar energy, retrofitting of properties, and more awareness of the need for disaster action plans.

Both earthquakes occurred when we were not in a normal operating day pattern. So, July 4th at 10am, the bulk of businesses were closed, and people were at home. On July 5th, the earthquake occurred at 7pm, which meant most people had returned home.

One area that is of equal concern is how does this impact during a normal operating period, i.e., two o'clock in the afternoon or 11am in the morning. Time has been spent looking at that in terms of emergency response.

Mr. Bruen stated that he would love to hear questions about Ridgecrest.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Discussion:

Commissioner De La Cruz stated that she appreciates Mayor Bruen's focus on population that is not typically thought about with earthquakes, which is mobile homeowners. She learned in Sonoma County the importance of multilingual emergency information going out to address populations that may not speak English or may not be connected to technology or alert systems.

Commissioner De La Cruz asked what Ridgecrest has seen in terms of outreach to communities that typically are not connected to some of these alert systems or this information, whether that has increased, and what has worked.

Mr. Bruen stated that it is probably not as much a massive change and it's probably because they are a smaller rural community with a strong mixed demographic. In the Latino sectors, resources have been added within the NIXIE resource which is a community response text message and alert system that allows people to make the choice between languages that they would receive the text in.

Emergency response plans and CERT teams have bilingual staff on them, including police departments and fire departments.

He continued to state work has been done to provide resources and no dramatic changes have been made yet.

Chairwoman Silva thanked Mayor Eric Bruen for the update today and the work being done.

VI. Update on OutSmart Disaster

Speaker – Gurbax Sahota, President & Chief Executive Officer, California Association for Local Economic Development

Ms. Valencia stated that the OutSmart Disaster Campaign is a statewide campaign housed within the California Office of Small Business Advocate. The campaign is designed to communicate risk, provide resources, and call to action from business and organizations across California with a goal of collectively becoming more prepared to reduce damages and speed up business recovery in the wake of the disaster. In 2017 and 2018, the SSC



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



provided the initial funding for this campaign in the amount of \$100,000. The campaign was centered around the HayWired Scenario. The SSC hired the Honey Agency, which is a branding firm, to develop a consumer-friendly platform and campaign to inform targeted audience on proactive earthquake preparedness, loss mitigation, and how to recover rapidly from earthquakes.

Building awareness about the HayWired Scenario and the findings that are published in the various reports, the Honey Agency created a recognizable and unique brand for the scenario. The deliverables included creating a toolkit of materials, a website, brochures, flyers, social media graphics, media press kit, and badges for projects, partners, and participating businesses. This was phase one of the project campaign.

Phase two was the statewide public engagement campaign and the development of the resilient Business Challenge, which was a call to action. After the Honey Agency completed its contractual scope of work, the campaign was then handed over to the California Academy for economic development.

Ms. Valencia introduced Gurbax Sahota, the President, and Chief Executive Office with the California Association for Local Economic Development. Ms. Sahota stated the investment made by the SSC has made a difference and grown in terms of the amount of funding and outreach for the campaign.

The California Association for Local Economic Development (CALED) is one of the largest economic development associations in the country and the largest in California. CALED has over 800 members, many of them being cities and counties including Sonoma, Los Angeles, and Rio Dell, and covers the entirety of the state.

CALED's focus is to figure out how to support local economic development. When looking at the economic disruptions of other events seen across the state, there's certainly a need to provide support to have sustainable economies and make sure that economic opportunities are available to residents.

Ms. Sahota stated that CALED partnered with Business, Consumer Services and Housing Agency to administer the OutSmart Disaster Campaign, and recently through an MOU moved the partnership from the Business, Consumer Services and Housing Agency to the Office of The Small Business Advocate where it's currently housed.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Ms. Sahota stated when CALED started down this path with OutSmart, the Federal Government had come to CALED immediately following the Tubbs Fire and asked for a tool to help businesses or communities, cities, and counties, prepare their businesses for these types of disasters or economic disruptions. CALED had an interest in this work but did not have the expertise.

The Federal USDA Rural Development Department asked CALED to put together a California infrastructure financing guidebook. It was seen that rural communities weren't prepared for disaster or to have a methodology for reviewing their projects, whether they were infrastructure-based projects or economic development projects.

Th Ms. Sahota shared with the SSC this guidebook which was specific to the Tubbs fire and lessons learned.

Additionally, the US Economic Development Administration reached out to CALED during COVID shutdowns and asked CALED to prepare a guide for local governments to help them with economic disruptions. Planning for resiliency, planning for recovery, talking about response and the role of local government.

CALED's original intent with the campaign was to work through cities, counties, and local nonprofits that help businesses and walk the businesses through the challenge.

It was found that as the shutdowns began, people were not necessarily interested in meeting in person and the top issue of the day wasn't planning for resiliency, it was how do we stay alive, especially those small businesses. The challenges that exist today, the five core components are really based not just off the work that SSC has done, but they have enhancements from federal resources such as FEMA as well as Cal OES. So as one is going through each part of the challenge, it'll have resources that help you map out your supply chain deferring to the folks that we know do this work.

Additionally, Ms. Sahota gave a brief update on the metrics of the campaign including successes and challenges it has faced over the years.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Discussion:

Commissioner Garnes thanked Mrs. Sahota for the presentation and the work done and expressed her appreciation for resiliency, preparedness, and outreach.

Commissioner Lopez thanks Mrs. Sahota for the presentation and asked if the data is available to be able to show where the engagement throughout California is coming from just to see if it is spread out or concentrated in a different area.

Mrs. Sahota stated she can share maps with Ms. Valencia to share with the SSC based on the last report, engagement was in the lower Central Valley and the Los Angeles area.

Chairwoman Silva asked if the data on traction and interest against the hazard zones is being correlated.

Mrs. Sahota stated that they overlaid the posts that went out with where it resonated, and it is something that can be shared but she doesn't know if the correlation is going to be as tight because the only two hazards that have had specific posts would be earthquakes and wildfires.

Commissioner De la Cruz asked which partners on the ground were able to get the message out and if there has been data collected that was desegregated by race and ethnicity of the business owners to help people navigate the recovery funding opportunities.

Mrs. Sahota stated that it is difficult to do outreach through nonprofits and she doesn't know if there was just an issue with technical assistance providers working with small businesses or if there is another issue. CALED's partners are local governments so when the traction was not seen happening with nonprofits, CALED started reaching out to another network.

Mrs. Sahota stated that Sonoma County has helped, and CALED is looking to do more in Spanish to reach Hispanic business owners.

Data by race is not a metric that has been tracked but is something for consideration that can be shared with OSBA as feedback from the SSC. Mrs. Sahota stated that she believes OSBA is going to be looking at technical



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



assistance providers that are nonprofits because those are the ones that fund through the Technical Assistance Program.

CALED's outreach will almost always be through local governments or economic development corporations.

Mrs. Sahota discussed the Infrastructure Financing Guidebook on Disaster Preparedness from an infrastructure perspective and talked about the psychological impact to the team, city, and county staff which is not normally mentioned when discussing preparedness, resiliency response, or recovery.

Chairwoman Silva asked if CALED is working through local Chambers of Commerce or if they have good access to the business community.

Mrs. Sahota explained that the original outreach of the campaign funded a couple of chambers but didn't see the traction that was hoped for. A function of the metric of success could be completing the challenge. Mrs. Sahota stated that she expects to see outreach to the chambers with OSBA.

VII. CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE § 11126(a)(1)

At this time the Commissioners recessed into closed session to discuss the hiring of the new Executive Director.

During closed session, SSC heard the recommendation of the Executive Director and affirmed by a unanimous vote. It would be announced publicly once the candidate accepts the offer.

IV. Miscellaneous Announcements

Ms. Valencia gave a brief update on the assessment fund. The SSC is funded through the insurance fund, is the primary funding source, and is derived from the annual assessments on insured, commercial, and residential property exposure from the previous year. Since fiscal year 2014-15, the assessment has been at 15 cents. The California Department of Insurance (CDI) is the entity that sets the assessment, and it is their recommendation that for this fiscal year 2022-2023, the assessment will be lowered to 13 cents with no negative programming impact to the SSC.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



V. Public Comment

No requests for public comment.

IX. Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 12:39pm by Chairwoman Silva.